

TOWN OF JUPITER STAFF REPORT FOR GENERATION CHURCH
TOWN MANAGER'S OFFICE



DATE: March 3, 2020
TO: The Honorable Mayor and Members of Town Council
THRU: Matt Benoit, Town Manager
FROM: John Sickler, Director of Planning & Zoning **J.S.**
SUBJECT: **Generation Church** – Site Plan amendment application to modify the phasing plan for the construction of parking, to modify the site and landscape plans, and minor architectural elevation changes for an existing church on a 2.4± acre property, at 510, 430, 418, and 412 Center Street.

Resolution # 35-20
PZ 20-4206
P. Begovich

P&Z Commission: **March 10, 2020**
Town Council: **April 21, 2020**

Project Information

Project Name: Generation Church
Property Owner: Generation Church International, Inc. (see Attachment A)
Agent: Cotleur and Hearing
Location: 510, 430, 418, and 412 Center Street
Acreage: 2.4± acres
Present land use designation: High and Medium Density Residential
Present zoning: Residential, Single-Family (R1)
Existing use: Existing Church
Request: Site plan amendment to modify:

- The phasing plan to add a phase to postpone upgrades to the existing parking areas west of N. Perry Avenue and east of Willet Avenue, and to change the phases in which the parking lots are improved;
- The site plan to restripe the existing paved parking lot, retain existing sidewalks and pathways, relocate a proposed sidewalk, and relocate a fence to expand a play area;
- The landscaping plan for the existing western parking lot and around the church building;
- The architectural elevations to change the roof material, window locations, window style, window trim style, and building stucco details, and add an awning; and,
- The color scheme to change the trim color, the window frame color, and the roof color. (See Attachment B)

Staff Recommendation:

The Department of Planning and Zoning recommends approval subject to the conditions in **Exhibit 1**.

Project Data

Pertinent site plan data and information in reference to the application is listed below:

Table 1: Adjacent Properties

Direction	Existing Land Uses	Future Land Use/Zoning Districts
North	Residential (Single-family)	Medium Density Residential Residential, Single-Family (R1)
South	Residential (Single-family)	High Density Residential Residential, Single-Family (R1)
East	Residential (Single-family)	High Density Residential Residential, Single-Family (R1)
West	Residential (Single-family)	Medium Density Residential Residential, Single-Family (R1)

Table 2: Site Plan Information

	Zoning district requirements	Applicant's proposal
Minimum lot area	10,000 square feet	106,377 square feet
Minimum lot width	75 feet	164 feet
Minimum lot depth	100 feet	150 feet
Maximum building height	35 feet	29.5 feet (to midpoint of existing tower)
Minimum green space	35 percent	16.7 percent

Table 3: Phase 1 Parking

	Minimum requirement	Applicant's proposal
Building A – 18,069 sf	18 spaces (1 per 1000 sf)	18 spaces
Building A – 272 seats	68 spaces (1 per 4 seats)	68 spaces
Building B – 764 sf	0 (1 space per 1000 sf)*	0 space
Total	86 spaces	86 spaces

*The existing storage building with no existing parking is on the eastern property, which is not included in the Phase 1 construction. Parking for the storage building will be included in Phase 2.

Table 4: Phase 2 Parking

	Minimum requirement	Applicant's proposal
Building A – 18,069 sf	18 spaces (1 per 1000 sf)	18 spaces
Building A – 408 seats	102 spaces (1 per 4 seats)	102 spaces
Building B – 764 sf	1 (1 space per 1000 sf)	1 space
Total	121 spaces	121 spaces

Table 5: Phase 3 Parking

	Minimum requirement	Applicant's proposal
Building A – 18,069 sf	18 spaces (1 per 1000 sf)	18 spaces
Building A – 476 seats	119 spaces (1 per 4 seats)	119 spaces
Building B – 764 sf	1 (1 space per 1000 sf)	1 space
Total	138 spaces	138 spaces

Table 6: Grass Parking

Phase	Maximum grass parking (75%)	Applicant's proposal
Phase 1	65 spaces	64 (74%)
Phase 2	91 spaces	64 (53%)
Phase 3	104 spaces	64 (45%)

Table 7: ADA Accessible Parking

Phase	Minimum requirement	Applicant's proposal
Phase 1	4	5
Phase 2	5	5
Phase 3	5	5

Table 8: Landscaping

Landscaping	Minimum requirements	Applicant's proposal (Phase One)
Percentage of native trees	50%	59%
Percentage of native palms	50%	67%
Percentage of native shrubs and groundcovers	50%	73%
Foundation planting	2,325 square feet	2,355 square feet

Table 9: Architectural

Architectural	Applicant's proposal
Building colors/type of construction	
Wall	Pure White - SW-7005
Trim	Caviar – SW-6990
Metal Railing	Black Swan – SW 6279
Scuppers and downspouts	Bronze
Canvas Awning (south elevation)	Black
Aluminum Window Frames	Bronze
Berridge steel simulated "S" tile	Terra-Cotta (Kynar 500 or Hylar 5000 color finish)

Table 10: Traffic

Traffic Performance Standards	Applicant’s proposal
Satisfies Palm Beach County/Town of Jupiter Traffic Performance Standards	Yes. A traffic impact statement was not performed for the application since the building area and total number of seats in the final phase has not increased.

Background / History

- The historic People’s Congregational Church chapel, which is 38’ x 64’, or approximately 2,400 sq. ft., was built in 1924.
- In the 1950’s, additions were constructed on the east and west sides of the historic chapel. The additions included the removal and reconstruction of portions of the exterior walls.
- At some point, another addition was built on the south side of the original historic chapel, which added a lower pitched roof and removed the rear gothic windows.
- On May 3, 1994, the Town Council approved a special exception and site plan for an addition including the sanctuary on the east side of the site and grass parking on the west parcel (west of N. Perry Avenue) through the approval of Resolution No. 19-94.
- On November 15, 2011, the Town Council approved a special exception to allow a daycare with a maximum of 50 children for Champions Academy through Resolution No. 50-11.
- On August 20, 2013, the Town Council approved the local historic designation of the original chapel while owned by Christian Family Church International through Resolution No. 32-13. The original historic chapel is the central portion of the building along Center Street that includes the two towers.
- On November 9, 2018, a minor site plan amendment was approved for interior renovations to the 1994 sanctuary addition, including a 1,775 square foot second-floor audio-visual production area.
- On December 18, 2018, the Town Council approved a special exception and site plan amendment to expand the existing church by 2,250 square feet, formalize and increase the capacity of parking and restore historic details through Resolution No. 86-18.
- The subject application was not considered minor by staff because the change in phasing reduces the initial number of parking spaces and therefore the number of seats allowed in Phase 1 is significantly less than what was approved by the Town Council. On February 24, 2020 the Historic Resources Board approved (by a 4-1 vote, with Board Member Mayo abstaining) a Special Certificate of Appropriateness (COA) for the historic chapel portion of structure. See Attachment D - Executive Summary for the COA, dated February 24, 2020. The COA approval allowed the following changes:
 - The trim color from “High Reflective White” to “Caviar”;
 - The roof material from clay barrel tile to a simulated terra-cotta colored S-tile steel roof; and,
 - Restore the central feature window in the historic chapel and replace the plastic with stained glass with the caveat that the church can come back and request a change in the color of the glass to a color that is period appropriate to 1924 consistent with their COA.

Analysis

Comprehensive Plan Consistency.

The proposed development is generally in conformance with the Comprehensive Plan. The subject site is consistent with the Town's objectives and policies for preserving historic properties and supporting their continued use, which include:

- Objective 1.13 of the Future Land Use Element is ***"To provide incentives that bring value to the community for infill development, desired redevelopment efforts, and upgrading of existing properties..."***
- Policy 1.13.2 states that the Town shall continue to provide incentives for redevelopment, such as greater flexibility through land development regulations including but not limited to parking, landscaping, greenspace, and setbacks.
- Objective 1.9 of the Coastal Management element states *"...historic resources on private property shall be protected, preserved, or used in a manner that will allow their continued existence."*
- Policy 1.9.10 and the adopted Future Land Use Map list People's Congregational Church as a historically significant site.

This proposed amendment continues to preserve the historic structure of the original chapel and will allow it to reopen as a religious institution consistent with the original use.

Site Plan and Parking.

The proposed development is in conformance with the Town's Land Development Regulations with staff's recommended conditions of approval. Specifically, the proposed project is in conformance with Division 30, entitled "Parking Regulations."

- Churches and other places of worship require one parking space per four seats and one parking space per 1000 square feet of assembly area.
- The proposed phasing plan ensures that sufficient parking is available by placing a cap on the number of seats in the church. The seat cap is based on the number of parking spaces constructed in each phase.
- Resolution No. 86-18 was approved with a phasing plan comprised of two phases:
 - Phase 1 included the 2,250 square foot addition to the church and the reconstruction of the central and western parking lot. The completion of Phase 1 was to include 64 grass parking spaces and 39 paved parking spaces, allowing Generation Church to operate with a maximum of 336 seats.
 - Phase 2 added 35 paved parking spaces in the eastern parking lot allowing Generation Church to operate with a maximum of 476 seats.
- The current request modifies Phase 1 to defer improvements to the existing western parking lot to a future Phase 3 due to financial reasons (see Attachment C). The proposed Phase 1 would allow Generation Church to obtain a Certificate of Occupancy to operate with 272 seats with minimal improvements to the existing western and central parking lots.
- The proposed modifications to the central parking lot includes removing an unbuilt landscape peninsula from the plans. The landscape island would have blocked a doorway, if built.
- On April 2, 2014, Generation Church at Maplewood Center was granted approval for an increase from 180 and 9,050 square feet of assembly to 445 seats and 15,100 square feet of assembly. According to the statement of use included with the 2014 application, Generation Church was operating three services a weekend when they had 180 seats. According to their website (www.generationchurch.com), the church currently holds two Sunday services. The Applicant has proposed to manage parking and traffic by holding up to three services to reduce the parking impact. By adding a third weekend service

when needed, staff finds that it is reasonable that the church can commence operations with 272 seats in Phase 1.

- According to the Statement of Use, Generation Church has designated a parking team leader and parking team who are dedicated to a close relationship/partnership with the Jupiter Police Department. Additionally, police officer(s) will assist with traffic on Center Street for a half-hour before and after each service.
- Pursuant to Section 27-2827(c)(1), entitled “General requirements”, when a use on a specific parcel of property has inadequate parking, the director of planning and zoning may require the preparation of a parking demand study by the owner. The study must be prepared in a timely manner and according to commonly accepted professional practices, and shall propose one or more remedies for providing adequate parking. The town council may require implementation of one or more of the remedies suggested by the parking demand study or other solutions as determined by the town council, to reduce or eliminate the parking deficiency.
- Pursuant to Section 27-2827(c)(2), the term “inadequate parking” means there is demand in excess of existing parking spaces characterized by all or virtually all parking spaces being occupied during daily, peak parking demand periods, at a minimum of once every seven days for at least two consecutive weeks. Inadequate parking is characterized by such actions as parking in rights-of-way or landscape medians or areas, illegal parking, parking in fire lanes, and patrons parking in lots associated with another use or structure.
- The previous site plan proposed parking for the existing storage building on the easternmost property designated as “Building B”. The proposed site plan does not provide parking for the building as part of Phase 1 construction. The required parking of one space for the storage building is provided in Phase 2.
- The unimproved east lot, while not officially approved as a parking lot, has historically been used for overflow parking. The proposed plan is to formalize this lot to a paved lot in Phase 2.
- The applicant has requested modifications to the site plan to allow the owner to retain the existing sidewalks in the North Perry Avenue right of way and within the site rather than replacing them with wider sidewalks.
- The proposal increases the daycare play area from 2,045 square feet to 2,262 square feet. The maximum number of children at the daycare is unchanged at 50.
- Phase 2 increases the number of paved parking spaces by 35. Phase 2 will provide an additional 136 seats bringing the total seats to 408. Phase 2 and 3 are included in one set of plans and the Phase 2 site data was not broken down separately. For clarity, staff is **recommending a condition of approval to requiring a separate Phase 2 and Phase 3 Master Plan, Site Plan, and Landscape Plan.**
- Phase 3 adds the upgrades to the existing western grass parking lot including 17 additional paved parking spaces, increasing the allowable seats by 68 seats to 476. Staff notes that moving the expansion of the western parking lot from Phase 1 to Phase 3 eliminates the need for 17 of the 81 spaces to be paved. Providing all 81 spaces as grass parking in Phase 3 would reduce the amount of impervious area and potentially reduce infrastructure costs to build the additional parking.

Landscaping.

The proposed development is in conformance with Chapter 23, entitled, “Landscaping”.

- While the applicant is proposing to postpone the reconstruction of the western parking lot to add 17 parking spaces until Phase 3, additional perimeter buffer and interior landscape plants are proposed in Phase 1. Specifically, trees will be installed in the existing gaps in the buffer, the perimeter hedge will be installed, and the parking island

shrubs will be installed. Existing zamia plants are proposed to remain. Additionally, trees not in conflict with the current configuration, including four large live oaks and a tabebuia will remain in place until Phase 3.

- Other minor modifications include preserving three Washingtonian palms near the playground in lieu of replacing them with a live oak tree.

Architecture.

- The property owner is requesting to change the trim color for the overall building from “High Reflective White” to “Caviar” which is a dark bronze and to replace the clay barrel tile approved on the Generation Church Site Plan with a “Terra-cotta” simulated S-tile steel roof, both items have already been completed as noted in the applicant’s Statement of Use (Attachment B).
- Because the central chapel (the portion of the building between and including the two towers) is designated historic, the changes to the color, roof material and front window modifications were required to be reviewed by the Historic Resources Board (HRB).
- The property owner is requesting the following modifications to the exterior elevations on the 1950’s and 2019 additions which have already been constructed:
 - Change the windows from eight-light colonial muntins and picture windows with white frames to two-lite proview/oriel (un-equal light) muntins with bronze frames;
 - Change the stucco trim (full surrounds) around the windows to stucco sills only;
 - Remove horizontal stucco bands.
 - The property owner is requesting to modify the exterior elevations to add scuppers and downspouts and replace a shed roof overhang with a black canvas awning. The downspouts and awning have not been installed.

Building Permit.

The modifications to the elevations effect the structural drawings for the project. The building plans for the master addition permit application #18-28268-COMM do not reflect the requested modifications, which already have been constructed. Therefore, staff is recommending a condition of approval requiring **the Owner to submit a revision to the master building permit to revise the construction drawings to match the request within 14 days of the effective date of the resolution.**

The product approval included with the roof sub-permit application #19-036456-ROOF-C is for a roof system known as “Advanced Aluminum Permatile”; however, a Berridge steel roofing system was installed but did not pass inspection. Therefore, staff is recommending a condition of approval **requiring the Owner to submit a revision to the roofing permit to provide the product approval for a Berridge “S-Tile” metal roof assembly within 14 days of the effective date of this resolution and prior to scheduling a final roof inspection.**

Signage.

The proposed development is in conformance with the Town’s sign regulations.

Miscellaneous.

Conditions 9 through 18 are carryover conditions of approval from Resolution Nos. 19-94, 50-11, and 86-18. These conditions were added to the current exhibit to avoid conflicts between the language.

Site plan criteria.

Section 27-175, contains minimum criteria for review of all development application processed. Upon review of the 12 criteria in Section 27-175, staff finds that the Applicant has satisfied 11 of the 12 criteria.

- 3) The proposed development is consistent with all applicable land development regulations and other portions of this Code.
- 4) The proposed development is compatible and/or consistent with the established or proposed character of a neighborhood or area.

As indicated in this analysis and Exhibit 1, staff has provided conditions of approval to ensure the development complies with the Town Code regarding parking and architecture standards.

Attachments:

Exhibit 1 – Conditions of approval

Attachment A – Statement of Use*

Attachment B – Letter from Pastor Ben to Town of Jupiter officials.*

Attachment C – Executive Summary for the Certificate of Appropriateness, dated 2-24-20*

Attachment D - Structural Integrity Letter regarding historic chapel*

* Please contact Peter J. Begovich at peterb@jupiter.fl.us or 561-741-2473 in order to obtain a copy of any attachments.

File Path:

V:\PlanningZoning\Staff\WP51\PROJECTS\Generation Church\PZ 20-4206 Modify Phasing Plan\2020.03.11 PZC Staff Report\Staff Report PZC (ARA).docx
March 3, 2020

Conditions of Approval

The recommendation for approval is subject to the following conditions:

- 1) The Owner shall install and maintain all improvements in compliance with the following:
 - i. Phase I Master Plan, Site Plan, and Details, prepared by Cotleur & Hearing, referenced as "Sheet 1 of 3, Sheet 2 of 3 and Sheet 3 of 3" dated 02/14/2020, received and dated by the Department of Planning and Zoning on 03/03/2020.
 - ii. Phase II and III Master Plan, Site Plan, and Details, prepared by Cotleur & Hearing, referenced as "Sheet 1 of 3, Sheet 2 of 3 and Sheet 3 of 3", dated 03/03/2020, received and dated by the Department of Planning and Zoning on 02/14/2020.
 - iii. Phase I Landscape Plan, prepared by Cotleur & Hearing, referenced as "Sheet 1 of 2 and Sheet 2 of 2", dated 02/14/2020, received and dated by the Department of Planning and Zoning on 03/03/2020.
 - iv. Phase II and III Landscape Plan, prepared by Cotleur & Hearing, referenced as "Sheet 1 of 2 and Sheet 2 of 2" dated 03/03/2020, received and dated by the Department of Planning and Zoning on 02/14/2020.
 - v. Main Floor Plan, Roof Plan, Elevations, prepared by Jon D. Olson, referenced as "A1.0, A1.2, A2.0, A2.1," dated 02/04/2020, received and dated by the Department of Planning and Zoning on 03/03/2020.
 - vi. Statement of Use, dated 02/14/2020, received and dated by the Department of Planning and Zoning on 02/14/2020.

- 2) The uses conducted on the subject property shall be consistent with the Statement of Use, dated 02/14/2020, and received by the Department of Planning and Zoning on 02/14/2020.

- 3) Any revisions to the site plan, justification statement, or other details submitted as part of this application, including but not limited to the location of the proposed improvements or additional, revised or deleted colors, materials, or structures, or changes to how the use operates, shall be submitted to the Department of Planning and Zoning and shall be subject to its review and approval.

- 4) The conditions of approval herein shall apply to the Owner, Applicant, and their successors and assigns.

- 5) **Site Plan.** Within 14 days of the effective date of this resolution, the owner shall modify the site plan to provide a separate Phase II and Phase III Master Plan, Site Plan, and Landscape Plan.

- 6) **Building Permit.** Within 14 days of the effective date of this resolution, the owner shall submit a revision to the master building permit #18-28268-COMM to update the construction drawings to match the approved plans.

- 7) **Roofing Permit.** Within 14 days of the effective date of this resolution and prior scheduling a final roofing inspection, the owner shall submit a revision to the roofing permit #19-036456-ROOF-C to provide the product approval for the Berridge "S" tile that was installed.

- 8) The applicant shall not install lighting fixtures exceeding eight feet in height along the southern boundary of the eastern parcel

- 9) No vehicular parking may be permitted within or along any adjacent right-of-way, which surrounds the eastern and western parcel. In addition, no vehicular parking areas may be in any manner direct or allow vehicles back in to the adjacent right-of-way.
- 10) This approval shall allow the Town the ability to install appropriate “no parking” signs to ensure parking along the adjacent right-of-way does not take place.
- 11) The applicant shall install steel bollards with a chain in between at the entrances of the parking on the west parcel to limit access to the parking for church members only.
- 12) The Owner shall ensure the times of church services and the operation of the daycare center shall not overlap.
- 13) The Owner shall ensure that number of children at the daycare does not exceed 50.
- 14) The Owner shall ensure all required licenses from the Department of Health are granted prior to the issuance of a business tax receipt.
- 15) Upon the submission of the final plans, and prior to the issuance of any development permit for Phase 2, the Applicant shall provide a Unity of Title for Parcels 1, 2, 3 and 4. The Unity of Title shall be subject to the review and approval of the Town Engineer.
- 16) Prior to the submission of the final plans, the Applicant shall revise the architectural elevations to note that smooth stucco treatment shall be used to distinguish the non-historic portions of the building.
- 17) Prior to the submission of the final plans, the Applicant shall revise the site plan and architectural plans to note that nighttime accent lighting will be provided on the historic chapel.
- 18) The placement of any type of vending machines or units which dispense food, beverages, candy, merchandise, products, goods, handbills or advertising magazines outside the confines of the principal structure on the exterior portions of the subject property within public view is prohibited.